

# **PROMISING PRACTICES IN AWARENESS RAISING, TRAINING, AND OUTREACH WORK TO IDENTIFY CASES OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING**

**A SCOPING REVIEW**

**DATE: MARCH 17, 2008**

**PREPARED BY:**

SIMON ZUKOWSKI, JUNIOR RESEARCHER, CROSS GOVERNMENT RESEARCH, POLICY  
AND PRACTICE BRANCH, OFFICE OF THE CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER, MINISTRY OF  
LABOUR AND CITIZENS' SERVICES



# TABLE OF CONTENTS:

Introduction .....	1
Context and Scope.....	1
Discussion.....	3
Coalition to Abolish Slavery & Trafficking (CAST) .....	3
Polaris Project .....	4
On the Road .....	9
International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD).....	10
International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) .....	13
International Organization for Migration (IOM) .....	15
Anti-Slavery International (ASI) .....	16
Conclusions.....	19
Key Findings.....	19
Applying the Findings to British Columbia: Key Local and Provincial Regulators .....	23
Appendix A – Search Terms and Databases .....	26
Appendix B – Contacts.....	27
Appendix C – Exemplary Additional Sources .....	29
Works Consulted.....	30



## **INTRODUCTION**

The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) has ranked Canada “high” as a destination country for human trafficking, “medium” as a transit country, and “low” as a country of origin (UNODC, 2005, 18-20). The problem of human trafficking in Canada is therefore a serious one. What is more, British Columbia has been found to be one of the major trafficking hubs within Canada (Department of Justice, 2005, iii-2).

Unfortunately, although a range of services is available to victims of human trafficking in British Columbia, finding trafficked persons is difficult at best due to the clandestine nature of this crime. To overcome this difficulty, key observers of human trafficking must be identified and promising practices in identifying trafficked individuals need to be explored and evaluated.

## **CONTEXT AND SCOPE**

The purpose of this Scoping Review is to identify key observers of trafficking and to explore promising practices in awareness raising, training, and outreach to identify cases of human trafficking. The Review does this by outlining and analyzing seven cases of good practice in these areas.

The case studies presented here consist of descriptions of actual practices of anti-human trafficking non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and inter-governmental organizations (IOs) for identifying cases of trafficking, as well as of outlines of training materials for potential key observers of human trafficking developed by such organisations.

Due to the implicit constraints of the nature of this Scoping Review, in some cases, only an outline of a document’s contents is provided, and the reader is encouraged to access the document her/himself for more information. All documents covered by this Review are freely accessible online.

The case studies included in this review are each organized into three sections. The “Context” section provides background to the main body of the case study. The “Key Observers” section lists the key observers identified in the case study. The third section entitled “Good Practices in Identifying Trafficked Persons” lists the promising practices in awareness raising, training, and outreach work to identify cases of human trafficking revealed by the case study.

The Scoping Review concludes with a “Key Findings” section where conclusions relating to key observers, awareness raising, training, and outreach are listed. A section listing BC regulatory bodies most relevant to combating human trafficking is also included and brings the Key Findings section to a close.

Finally, there are three appendices at the end of the scoping review. Appendix A lists search terms, internet search engines and databases used as the basis of online research for this review. Appendix B lists those organizations and persons contacted by the author for the purposes of this review, and who have expressed a willingness to be contacted in the future. Appendix C lists exemplary sources on promising practices in identifying trafficked persons which are not included in the main body of this scoping review. The Appendices are meant to serve as resources for future research in the area covered by this review.

The cases presented here were selected based on their relevance to the topic and the quality of information they contained. An effort was also made to present materials relating to a broad range of key observers and practices. These two objectives of quality and range had to be balanced against one another, as the most comprehensive and best designed training materials tended to cluster around a narrow range of key observers.

The relative unavailability of materials on the Canadian experiences in this area of study necessitated the use of international perspectives in this Scoping Review. Three of the case studies presented here, therefore, come from the American perspective on subject, while three come from a broadly European perspective and one from the Italian perspective.

Although all of the findings of this Scoping Review can be applied to domestic trafficking, the timeframe of this project did not allow for a thorough examination of that topic. Resources with an explicit focus on domestic trafficking are rare, but any future research exploring promising practices in the domestic sphere would benefit from examining the literature concerning countries of origin. As Canada is a destination and transit country but not a significant origin country for human trafficking, the literature on countries of origin was not reviewed for this project.

## DISCUSSION

### ***Coalition to Abolish Slavery & Trafficking (CAST)***

URL: <http://www.castla.org/>

#### *Context*

CAST is a Californian NGO established for the exclusive purpose of assisting trafficked persons. CAST's three main program areas are: social services, legal services, and training and advocacy. Since 1998, CAST-administered training programs in 23 U.S. States have trained over 5,000 persons (CAST, 2005).

#### *Key Observers*

CAST's target audiences for training are law enforcement groups at the local, state, and federal levels, refugee issuing agencies, and community and faith-based organizations that may come into contact with trafficked persons such as "domestic violence/sexual assault centers, ethnic community centers, and health clinics" (Personal communication with Imelda Buncab, Outreach & Training Director, CAST, Feb. 20, 2008).

A brochure advertising training administered by CAST recommends that the following groups of persons undergo training: attorneys and legal providers, community service providers, Department of Labour investigators, Department of Homeland Security agents, domestic violence survivor advocates, faith-based service providers, FBI agents, medical and mental health providers, police and sheriff personnel, prosecutors, refugee providers, sexual assault survivor advocates, shelter staff and victim witness coordinators (Freedom Network, n.d).

#### *Promising practices in Identifying Trafficked Persons*

CAST uses the training curriculum of the Freedom Network Institute on Human Trafficking (<http://www.freedomnetworkusa.org/>) a national body which CAST helped to establish. The Institute's curriculum consists of four modules which can be presented over two days (although CAST training sessions are usually half-day or day long) (Personal communication with Imelda Buncab, Outreach & Training Director, CAST, Feb. 20, 2008).

Module 1 provides an overview of human trafficking, the human rights approach to assisting trafficked persons, and the U.S. government's response to human trafficking. Module 2 discusses methods for identifying trafficked persons and presents case studies of trafficking. Module 3 discusses the provision of social

services to trafficked persons, and includes subsections on: human service needs of survivors of trafficking, case management tools, and coordination of human services. The final module discusses the legal framework surrounding human trafficking and its victims, including victims' rights, forms of legal relief, and issues relating to the prosecution of traffickers.

According to CAST's Outreach & Training Director, training should:

“Be multi-faceted to address various learning modes by applying adult learning theory/methods. Also, training can be conducted to a mixed group (service providers and law enforcement) or [be] group specific. When conducting group specific training, [it is] critical to stress the importance of collaboration between the disciplines.”

NGOs can bring cases to the attention of the police or may convince trafficked persons to approach and co-operate with law enforcement (Personal communication with Imelda Buncab, Outreach & Training Director, CAST, Feb. 20, 2008).

### ***Polaris Project***

URL: <http://www.polarisproject.org/>

#### *Context*

Founded in 2002, Polaris Project is a U.S. NGO which focuses on providing a comprehensive and community-based approach to the fight against human trafficking. This approach includes: operating human trafficking hotlines, conducting public awareness campaigns, community training, direct outreach and victim identification, the provision of social services to victims, and policy advocacy. The Polaris Project is the recipient of a major grant from the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services to administer The National Human Trafficking Centre. The Centre is a national human trafficking hotline and referral service (Polaris Project, n.d.).

Polaris Project's comprehensive strategy makes the organization very amenable to sharing advice on best practices with others. Combined with its substantial experience in the field of anti-human trafficking, this makes Polaris Project a valuable resource. The information below comes from a phone consultation with Bradley Myles, Deputy Director of Polaris Project, which took place on February 26, 2008. Myles's comments pertain to his understanding of anti-human trafficking efforts in the U.S. in general, unless specifically noted.

### *Key Observers*

According to Myles, there is no clear-cut right answer to the question of which audiences should be targeted for awareness raising or training. He advises creativity when considering this issue.

Myles notes that U.S. anti-human trafficking efforts have targeted the following groups:

- Court system: judges and court clerks;
- Corrections system: corrections officers, probation and parole officers, youth detention facility staff;
- Immigration/Refugee system: immigration, visa issuing officers, and immigration officers dealing with refugee issues;
- Legal profession: “the whole legal profession” including private and public lawyers, law firms, free legal clinics, and immigration law;
- Health care system: doctors, emergency room doctors, nurses, clinic personnel;
- Child welfare system: investigators who go into homes to investigate abuse (training for this group was stressed as being “very important”);
- Law enforcement officials: special units or task forces, regular officers (Polaris has trained every local police officer in the Washington, D.C. area);
- Help desk staff at local government;
- Youth shelter staff;
- Tradespersons: air-conditioning and TV repair personnel, cable technicians;
- Fire-fighters;
- Mail delivery persons;
- School system: teachers, councillors, principals;

- At-risk groups: low income persons, homeless and/or run-away youth (a very high risk group), sex trade workers (also a very high risk group), jail population; and
- Religious institutions: pastors/priests, church leaders.

### *Promising practices in Identifying Trafficked Persons*

Myles stresses that before attempting to reach a trafficked person, one should prepare for the implications of success. It is a good practice to create hypothetical scenarios involving the rescue of victims of trafficking and consult with agencies that may be called on to provide services to such victims to ensure their readiness to handle potential cases. It is important to ensure that these agencies have the staff, training, and services (e.g. translation services) to properly assist a victim of trafficking.

According to Myles, public awareness raising can be accomplished through:

- Poster campaigns: in places such as buses, trains, and taxis, as well as at transportation hubs/stations;
- TV campaigns: for example, infomercials or public service announcements on public access or major network TV. Ad agencies and stations can be approached for free ad time/space;
- Radio campaigns: public service announcement (cheaper and easier than a TV campaign); and
- Speeches/announcements: prominent public officials or celebrities can bring attention to the issue of human trafficking. A large media presence at such events is paramount.

Myles stresses that awareness raising activities must be complemented by mechanisms by which the public can contact appropriate authorities or service providers. In the U.S., a human trafficking hotline is by far the most commonly used such mechanism. There are a number of considerations when creating a hotline. One of these is the hours of operation. A hotline open for at least 18 hours a day is recommended (Polaris uses a 24 hour hotline). Polaris Project's hotline is based on a decentralised model wherein calls to the National hotline are routed to cell phones of staff members. Another consideration in creating a hotline is who should staff it. While law enforcement staffed hotlines (like that in

place in the city of Los Angeles) are in the best position to offer immediate assistance, they are sometimes distrusted by members of the public and trafficked persons.<sup>1</sup>

In contrast to public awareness campaigns, which are usually directed at the public as a whole, outreach activities are more finely targeted and in some cases involve detailed training. Myles distinguishes between two types of outreach: indirect outreach and direct outreach.

Indirect outreach seeks to educate and equip persons who are likely to come into contact with human trafficking victims (see the key observers section above). Myles explains that “indirect outreach is just another synonym for community training, and training as many people as you can and casting as wide a net as you can, and then giving them a hotline to call, and hoping that they do their job, and hoping that [...] one day throughout their life they bump into a victim of trafficking and they remember the training and they call the number.”

Usually the training consists of presentations relying on PowerPoint, video, brochures, and other hand-outs.

According to Myles, the big weakness of indirect outreach

“Is that you’re depending on someone else, ultimately, to do the job. And I’ve [...] given over 200 trainings on trafficking, and I have no idea if those trainings have made any impact at all on the lives of victims. And I could be deceiving myself, because say I go train eight nurses, and I give them two hours of training and they’re all really excited, and then I walk out of the training and then I say ‘wow I hope they identify a victim of trafficking.’ They may forget the training, they may have a victim sitting right before them and not realize it [...] there may be staff turn-over. So ultimately [...] there may be zero victims ever identified based on that training. And so I think training is a necessary step, but it’s not, sort of, the full picture, because there are so many communities in the U.S. that have just done that training, and they still haven’t identified many victims. [...] So if you only do a training initiative I would say the number of victims that will come forward will be very low.”

---

<sup>1</sup> For an example of a good practice in human trafficking hotline operations and an extended discussion, see *Good Practices in Response to Trafficking in Human Beings: Cooperation between Civil Society and Law Enforcement in Europe*. Danish Red Cross. & C. Aradau. (2005).

For this reason, Polaris engages in very vigorous direct outreach activities, which aim to find and contact trafficked persons directly. Direct outreach targets at-risk populations. Polaris does direct outreach in jails and juvenile detention centres by talking to inmates and trying to establish if they are themselves trafficked persons, or if they know of others who are. According to Myles, jails and juvenile detention centres “are two good places to start.” Even trafficked persons who are in the country illegally may appear in jails, rather than in immigration detention centers, if the police officer bringing them in does not check their immigration status. If their status is checked and they turn out to be in the country illegally, they will likely be transported to an immigration detention facility. Polaris has seen cases in which they convinced immigration officials to let them talk to persons held in immigration detention, and have identified victims in that way.

Some of the other places Polaris conducts outreach include

- Courts: Polaris has various protocols with different court systems whereby the judge or the court clerk notifies Polaris every time a woman comes in front of the court on a prostitution charge. Polaris is given the woman’s name and case number. Myles recommends trying to find an organization involved in outreach to victims of prostitution who might be willing to do this type of work;
- Places run-away youth are likely to congregate: Such as certain after-school programs, certain youth shelters, or shopping malls;
- Religious institutions: Myles explains that some persons being victimized may be religious and lacking any other type of support, they may turn to a church, temple, or mosque, as they often shame and have a need to reach out to a higher power. There have been a number of trafficked persons identified through churches. Polaris has agreements in place with churches whereby Polaris is notified if a church official encounters a potential trafficking victim; and
- Substance abuse clinics: Trafficking victims may also be found here.

Myles emphasizes that for an approach to identifying trafficked persons to be effective, all the pieces discussed here (public awareness, hotline, training, direct outreach) must be implemented together.

## ***On the Road***

URL: <http://www.ontheroadonlus.it/>

### *Context*

On the Road is an Italian NGO active in the area of outreach to sex trade workers. On the Road's approach is notable for its use of mobile outreach teams which identify, contact, and refer sex trade workers. Although On the Road's focus is the sex industry as a whole, its teams are equipped to identify victims of trafficking.

### *Key Observers*

The key observers in this case are the On the Road outreach team members themselves, and the sex trade workers they contact through their work.

### *Promising practices in Identifying Trafficked Persons*

On the Road outreach teams carry out research into the practice of prostitution by mapping out areas where prostitution is found to exist, and tracking changes over time. The central part of On the Road's activities is "contact work" which "ranges from brief contacts for the presentation of On the Road or offers of condoms or information materials to more important contacts that attempt to establish a more stable relationship." It is often through such stable relationships that trust between trafficked persons and the outreach team is created and that trafficked persons may come to identify themselves as victims and seek help (Danish Red Cross, 2005, 73-74).

The On the Road outreach team also utilizes two "cultural moderators," one Albanian and one Nigerian, to help to convey information and establish a relationship of trust with victims. Another Italian NGO working with sex trade workers, Tampep, includes two sex trade workers in its outreach team as "social moderators" in addition to two cultural intermediaries of Nigerian and Slavic origins (Red Cross, 74).

In 2004, On the Road started a program aimed at making contact with sex trade workers operating indoors (Red Cross, 76). Such a program is important wherever a significant portion of the sex industry is located indoors.

## ***International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD)***

URL: <http://www.icmpd.org/>

### *Context*

ICMPD is a Vienna-based inter-governmental organization that aims to develop and promote comprehensive and sustainable migration policies for the European geographical area. As part of its mandate, ICMPD has been active in the issue area of human trafficking, and particularly in developing training materials. ICMPD has developed comprehensive training packages for judges, prosecutors, and law enforcement personnel.

### *Key Observers*

The audiences that ICMPD has specifically targeted are judges, prosecutors (ICMPD, 2006a) and law enforcement, including police, border guards, and customs officials in EU Member States and Accession and Candidate countries (ICMPD, 2006d).

The ICMPD recommends training not just specialised law enforcement units such as investigators or anti-trafficking units, but also non-specialised personnel, and frontline personnel in particular. ICMPD maintains that according to recent evidence, such non-specialized personnel can “play a very important role and contribute significantly to the initial identification of cases and to the gathering of frontline-level intelligence of use for the specialised investigators” (ICMPD, 2006d, p. 6).

### *Promising practices in Identifying Trafficked Persons*

#### **Training for Judges and Prosecutors**

ICMPD has developed a training package meant to increase awareness of human trafficking among judges and prosecutors and to improve their capability to react to the cases of human trafficking they may encounter. The training package consists of three documents: a *Background Reader* (ICMPD, 2006a) a *Handbook* (ICMPD, 2006b) and a *Curriculum - Training Guide* (ICMPD, 2006c).

The *Background Reader* addresses most topics relating to trafficking which are of relevance to judges and prosecutors. The document follows a modular approach and is divided into six chapters. Each chapter is preceded by objectives indicating what trainees should expect to have learnt at the end of the chapter,

enabling trainees and trainers to choose the topic of most interest to them. The *Background Reader* is 180 pages long.

The *Handbook* follows the same structure as the *Background Reader*, and reproduces its summary and the key points. The *Handbook* is to be handed out to trainees together with the *Background Reader*. Being considerably shorter than the *Background Reader*, it can be used for quick reference (adapted from ICMPD, 2006a, p. 9).

According to information provided in the ICMPD *Background Reader*, both the *Background Reader* and the *Handbook* have the following structure:

Chapter 1 describes the phenomenon of trafficking in human beings, including the trafficking process, international definitions of trafficking, the difference between trafficking and smuggling, the root causes of trafficking, the different forms of exploitation and manifestations of trafficking, and gives an idea of the global extent of trafficking.

Chapter 2 provides the most basic background on traumatic events and their impact upon affected individuals, especially with regard to victims of trafficking.

Chapter 3 describes the international instruments that can be used to investigate, prosecute and adjudicate trafficking in human beings. Furthermore, specific national anti-trafficking laws or provisions that criminalize trafficking in the respective penal codes are outlined for each country.

Chapter 4 describes the core aim of all efforts to prevent and combat trafficking and to protect, assist and provide redress to victims. It outlines the comprehensive approach to fighting trafficking, which should entail at the least the following four main components: identification; residence permit/ reflection period; victim support and redress/access to justice.

Chapter 5 describes the criminal proceedings and in this context the rights of victims that must be respected throughout.

Chapter 6 is structured according to the relevant instruments for international co-operation to be used by the judiciary in the fight against trafficking in human beings, with an emphasis on co-operation within the European Union. The emphasis is on judicial co-operation in criminal matters. However, since police co-operation cannot be completely independent from judicial co-operation,

instruments of police co-operation are also included in this chapter (ICMPD, 2006a, 9).

A *Curriculum - Training Guide* accompanies the *Background Reader* and the *Handbook*. The curriculum is designed specifically for trainers. An overview in table form outlines the sequence, content, suggested teaching/learning activities, time frame, and reference material needed (adapted from ICMPD, 2006a, p. 9).

The *Curriculum - Training Guide* leads trainers through the training material in a step-by-step process, offering helpful suggestions on possible delivery techniques, activities, reference materials, time frames, and participants' questions.

It also includes valuable annexes. Annex A provides 15 case scenarios to be used throughout the course to illustrate the main points. Annex B provides trainers with a list of relevant legal instruments. Annex C includes a training evaluation form. Annex D provides a wealth of advice to trainers on instructional techniques including an introduction to the role of the trainer/facilitator, the principles of adult learning, the mechanics of the training process, training tools, and effective facilitation.

### **Training for Law Enforcement**

ICMPD has also developed a human trafficking training package for police, border guards, and customs officials. The package, called *Anti-Trafficking Training for Frontline Law Enforcement Officers*, consists of a *Background Reader* (ICMPD, 2006d) and a *Training Guide* (ICMPD, 2006e).

The two documents are structured as follows:

The training guide is a concise, self-contained curriculum of five units meant to guide the trainer through a suggested sequence of training. Each unit is introduced by objectives indicating what trainees should be able to do at the end of the unit. Thereafter, an overview in table form outlines the sequence, content, suggested teaching/learning activities, time frame, and reference material needed. In its Annex, the training guide provides trainers with case examples and exercises to be used during the training sessions.

The background reader follows the same structure; it also comprises five chapters which present material related to the respective unit in the teaching guide, in more depth and in a complementary way. Parts of the material may be

used as handouts for participants. Some national teams have even handed out the complete background reader as reference material to participants.

The Training Guide and the Background Reader have the following structure:

Chapter 1 gives the international definition of trafficking in human beings and describes the main legal instruments. Specific national anti-trafficking laws or provisions that criminalize trafficking in the respective penal codes are to be added for each country. Furthermore, the specific role of front line police in combating trafficking in human beings is outlined.

Chapter 2 describes the trafficking process with its various forms and the difference between trafficking and smuggling.

Chapter 3 explains the importance of the multi-agency approach in investigating and prosecuting trafficking cases, protecting the victim and preventing the crime. Information on the concept and practice of national referral mechanisms as well as measures offered by service providers and NGOs are given.

Chapter 4 outlines the process of identifying trafficking cases and how to approach victims of trafficking. It also provides basic background information on traumatic events and their impact upon affected individuals, especially with regard to victims of trafficking.

Chapter 5 outlines the role of front line police in gathering intelligence and interviewing suspected traffickers (ICMPD, 2006d, 7).

### ***International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP)***

URL: <http://www.theiacp.org/>

#### ***Context***

IACP is the world's oldest and largest non-profit association of police executives. IACP's mission is to offer leadership and support to its membership of over 20,000. As part of this effort, IACP produced *The Crime of Human Trafficking: A Law Enforcement Guide to Identification and Investigation* (IACP, n.d.) This guidebook aims to provide police officers with the knowledge and techniques to investigate cases of human trafficking safely and effectively.

## Key Observers

The *Guide* is intended for a law enforcement audience, particularly for police officers who might come into contact with trafficking activities either as first responders or as investigators.

### *Promising practices in Identifying Trafficked Persons*

The *Guide* is concise enough to be accessible to its audience yet it also provides relevant information that goes beyond broad generalizations. The *Guide* is summarized below:

*Introduction:* Provides a brief overview of the issue of human trafficking globally and in the United States. It also motivates the readers by explaining the special role of law enforcement in combating human trafficking.

*Defining Human Trafficking:* Provides a definition of human trafficking under U.S. law.

*Trafficking vs. Smuggling:* Identifies the differences between the two phenomena and lists some common misconceptions about the nature of human trafficking.

*Strategies of Identifying Human Trafficking:* Lists examples of legal violations that may lead an officer to encounter human trafficking. A short list of key indicators of possible trafficking is also provided in this section, as is a list of types of human trafficking. This section also briefly advises police officers on how to react to possible human trafficking cases.

*Dynamics of Human Trafficking:* Presents a list of possible methods of control of traffickers over victims, as well as a list of possible reasons why victims may be reluctant to approach and/or cooperate with law enforcement. This section also offers a brief description of trafficking organizations.

*Action Agenda Checklist:* Identifies concrete steps to be taken at the institutional and training levels to facilitate success in reaching trafficked persons.

*Trauma and Trafficking:* Briefly explains how the experiences of trafficked persons may be traumatizing, how such trauma may be manifested, and what implications this has for investigative work.

*An Effective Response to Human Trafficking:* Emphasizes the importance of building collaborative relationships with federal jurisdictions, community organizations, and NGO service providers for building a successful trafficking case. This section also provides descriptions of both the proactive and the reactive response to investigating human trafficking. It also addresses practical considerations around victim safety. A protocol for successful interviews is included as a sidebar.

*Resources:* Includes information on government programs available to victims, and lists the main federal and state agencies and NGOs involved in the fight against human trafficking.

### ***International Organization for Migration (IOM)***

URL: <http://www.iom.int/jahia/jsp/index.jsp>

#### ***Context***

Created in 1951 and consisting of 122 member states, IOM is the leading inter-governmental organization working on issues of migration. IOM has been active in the area of prevention of human trafficking, by carrying out awareness campaigns in source and destination countries, providing technical support to governments and NGOs, and conducting research.

In 2006, IOM developed the *Resource Book for Law Enforcement Officers on Good Practices in Combating Child Trafficking* (IOM, 2006) which will be the focus of this section. The *Resource Book* was developed with funding from a European Commission project and it focuses on the European Union experience with trafficking.

#### ***Key Observers***

The *Resource Book* is specifically focused on law enforcement officers with some practical experience in combating child trafficking. However, it also identifies NGOs and social service providers as important observers of human trafficking.

#### ***Promising practices in Identifying Trafficked Persons***

The *Resource Handbook* has the following structure:

*Introduction:* provides background on child trafficking, both globally and in the European context

*Age Assessment:* presents and evaluates different methods of ages assessment, including psychosocial assessment, dental examination, bone Xray, and a combination of these methods. All methods are illustrated by case studies.

*Investigative Methods:* discusses investigative techniques such as proactive/intelligence-led investigation, reactive/victim-led investigation, and disruptive investigation. This section also focuses on strategic and operational risk assessment, and on bilateral and international cooperation.

*Interviewing Techniques:* describes the interviewing techniques to be used during first contact with a potential victim of trafficking, the first intake interview, and the first evidential interview. It also describes witness protection considerations and training for the actors involved in the interview process.

*Cooperation Between Law Enforcement and NGOs:* explains the rationale for cooperation between law enforcement and NGOs and social service providers, and provides some standards of good practice in this area. Presents examples of cooperation on the identification and referral of child victims, direct assistance to child victims, model protocols for cooperation, and assistance in countries of origin in upon return of a child victim. (adapted from IOM, 2006, 16)

Each section ends with a list of specific good practice recommendations which can also be found in the *Resource Book's* concluding section.

### ***Anti-Slavery International (ASI)***

URL: <http://www.antislavery.org/>

#### *Context*

ASI is the world's oldest international human rights NGO, and the United Kingdom's only NGO dedicated exclusively to combating slavery and related abuses. In 2005, ASI developed the *Protocol for Identification and Assistance to Trafficked Persons and Training Kit* (ASI, 2005) The *Protocol* is examined below.

#### *Key Observers*

Although the *Protocol's* focus is on law enforcement officials such as front-line police and immigration officers, detention centre workers, and specialized police units, it acknowledges that initial referrals to law enforcement can be made by groups like "NGOs, community-based organisations, faith-based organisations, trade unions, social workers, labour inspectors, embassies, tax inspectors [and] recruitment agencies." The *Protocol* also identifies "the agricultural sector, sex

industry, domestic work, sweat shops and the garment sector more generally, the construction sector, the food industry, and nursing” as sectors most prone to penetration by human trafficking, although it cautions against adopting too narrow a focus (ASI, 2005, 19).

### *Promising practices in Identifying Trafficked Persons*

The *Protocol* has the following structure:

#### *Defining the Problem:*

- Offers an overview of human trafficking and related practices, explains the differences between them and contextualizes them in international law and European Union law.

#### *Identification Protocol:*

- Describes the practical aspects of victim identification, including sub-sections on recognizing the signs/indicators of human trafficking, specific interview techniques, and cooperation with a victim of trafficking on gathering information for a formal statement.
- Outlines the “principles of practice” law enforcement should follow to obtain the best possible evidence when interviewing trafficked persons: truthfulness, respect, competence, pragmatism, responsibility (ASI, 2005, 19).
- Identifies possible communication barriers which should be taken into account before an interview begins. These barriers may be issues related to the victim’s gender, immigration status, fear of reprisals, relation to the trafficker, cultural background, and individual circumstances and reactions (ASI, 2005, 20-21).
- Provides guidelines on how to behave during an interview. Interviewers are advised to be professional and approachable, show respect, be clear, be aware of possible safety implications of their actions for the victim, and to “be there” for the victim (ASI, 2005, 21-22).
- Describes in detail the process of determining whether a person is a victim of trafficking. This includes a checklist of superficial indicators of trafficking, steps to follow during the initial interview, and an outline of

the formal interview process, through which the victim's statement is to be taken (ASI, 2005, 27-31).

The *Training Kit* for trainers and facilitators:

- Focuses on providing basic information about human trafficking and victim identification skills. Each section of the training kit contains practical advice for the facilitator on how best to deliver the training material.
- Describes the structure of a possible opening session of training where participants are asked to fill out a survey testing their knowledge about the subject of human trafficking. The survey results then form the basis for discussion. A trafficking awareness survey handout and an answer key are also included (ASI, 2005, 37-40).
- Describes a session on building relationships with trafficked persons. Explores in detail the investigative values of truthfulness, respect, competence, pragmatism, and responsibility (ASI, 2005, 42-44).
- Discusses the theory of human communication in the context of investigating human trafficking. The document also contains a role-play exercise to make training participants more conscious of how their communications may be perceived by trafficking victims.
- Introduces participants to basic communication techniques as tools for conducting successful interviews. The communication skills emphasized are paying attention to the client, active listening, and understanding non-verbal communication. Provides two practical exercises for trainees (ASI, 2005, 48-54).
- Discusses the impact of cultural differences on the interview process. Introduces trainees to the theory of culture and cultural differences and provides comparisons between select countries' cultural values in terms of indicators such as individualism vs. collectivism, masculinity vs. femininity, power distance, and uncertainty avoidance. It also provides two exercises designed to get participants to discuss their experiences with cross-cultural communication (ASI, 2005, 55-58).

- Contains a detailed step-by-step guide to conducting an initial interview and draws upon the theoretical lessons discussed in preceding sections (ASI, 2005, 59-65).

The Annexes to the *Protocol* contain country reports on identification and assistance to trafficked persons for the United Kingdom and Italy (ASI, 2005, 66-76).

## CONCLUSIONS

### *Key Findings*

This section is divided into sections listing major findings about key observers, promising practices in awareness raising measures, training, and outreach respectively.

### *Key Observers*

This Scoping Review has identified many potential key observers of human trafficking. While all the groups identified are important, some have been stressed more than others in the case studies presented here.<sup>2</sup> These key observers are:

- Law enforcement personnel such as frontline officers, investigators and members of special task forces;
- Outreach organizations either directly focused on human trafficking, or engaged with at-risk populations such as sex trade workers, the homeless,

---

<sup>2</sup> A caveat is necessary. The parameters of this project did not allow for a comprehensive survey of the literature on promising practices in awareness raising, training, and outreach to combat human trafficking. This means that, while an effort was made to ensure that the case studies chosen for analysis are representative of the relevant literature, this Scoping Review might nonetheless be subject to some sampling error. Secondly, it is possible that the literature itself does not reflect with total accuracy the relative importance of various key observer groups. The prevalence of training materials for law enforcement, for example, may be due in part to the fact that governments who are responsible for law enforcement training have at their disposal resources which are unavailable to NGOs. Thirdly, there may not yet have been time to develop comparable promising practices for less traditional observers such as by-law enforcement officers or inspectors. Lastly, the particularities of the Canadian and British Columbian context must be kept in mind.

homeless youth, victims of violence, women, and adult and juvenile offenders;

- The court system, including judges, prosecutors and clerks; and
- Immigration and customs officers in general and visa issuing officers and immigration officers dealing with refugee issues in particular.

Mentioned slightly less often were:

- Corrections officers, probation and parole officers, youth detention facilities staff;
- Health care workers such as doctors, nurses and clinic personnel, especially emergency personnel;
- The child welfare system, especially inspectors and investigators;
- Labour standards inspectors; and
- Religious leaders/ service providers.

Other key observer groups mentioned were:

- Code inspectors like fire or liquor licence inspectors as well as health inspectors;
- Public and private lawyers;
- Ethnic community centres and ethnic communities in general;
- Government help-desk staff;
- Clients of prostitution;
- Repair/installation technicians who make house calls (e.g. TV repair personnel or cable technicians);
- School personnel like teachers, councillors and principals; and
- Fire-fighters and mail delivery persons.

### *Promising Practices in Awareness Raising*

The most commonly practiced awareness raising methods include poster, TV or radio campaigns, or the use of high-ranking officials or celebrities to draw attention to the issue of human trafficking.

Research undertaken for this project has shown that the use of awareness raising campaigns is a very widespread anti-trafficking strategy. This popularity is likely the result of two factors: 1) awareness raising can be relatively inexpensive and easy to implement and; 2) it can potentially have a very broad reach, reaching those in the public who would otherwise not receive any anti-trafficking training. This second point especially makes awareness raising appealing, since an aware public is more likely to notice potential trafficking cases and bring them to the attention of the authorities.

However, the evidence from this Scoping Review also shows that, by itself, awareness raising is not a sufficient response to human trafficking. To be effective, awareness raising needs to be complemented by an effective human trafficking hotline and by vigorous training and outreach activities.

### *Promising Practices in Training Key Observers*

The evidence presented in this Scoping Review allows for several conclusions about what constitutes good practice in the training of key observers:

- The training should be created and administered by a multidisciplinary team (inputs from NGOs, other agencies, and government jurisdictions should be sought)
- The training should be audience-specific.
- Training should strike a balance between a theoretical overview of trafficking-related issues, and practical advice to the trainees on handling situations they may be likely to encounter.
- Training materials should include solid pedagogical advice and tools for trainers/facilitators, and these persons should optimally have some instructional background.
- The training itself may be anywhere from two hours to several days long, depending on the audience (a half day to two day range appears most common) and should be followed up to improve retention.

- Training should emphasize the human rights approach to dealing with victims of trafficking.
- Handbooks or guides which could serve as future reference should be handed out to participants. Such materials should be well designed and strike a balance between conciseness and comprehensibility.

Although the contents of training materials vary, a typical training manual that aims to provide participants with a solid introduction to the problem of human trafficking might have the following structure:

- An introduction to human trafficking and an explanation as to why the participants should be concerned about this crime.
- An overview of the relevant legal and institutional framework.
- An overview of the dynamics of human trafficking.
- A section on how to recognize a potential victim of trafficking.
- An exploration of potential cultural or emotional barriers to effective communication with victims.
- A section or sections outlining actions to be taken if a potential victim of trafficking is encountered.
- A listing of resources for further learning and support.

Depending on the audience, the learning objectives, and the time-frame, the training should, in various proportions, include exercises, videos, and case studies.

### *Promising Practices in Outreach Activities*

Whereas awareness raising and training are passive measures which require the victim to make contact with a key observer in order for the victim to be identified, outreach is an active process of seeking out and making contact with potential victims. There is currently no data available on the relative efficacy of the three strategies; however, NGOs active in the area of combating human trafficking view outreach activities as being extremely valuable. A strong outreach

component must therefore be part of any comprehensive anti-human trafficking strategy.

Research conducted in the course of this Scoping Review indicates that successful outreach happens in places with concentrations of populations at high risk for human trafficking. These include prostitution districts, adult, juvenile and immigration detention centres, the courts, and places runaway youths are likely to congregate in, such as certain after-school programs, and certain youth shelters or shopping malls. If possible, arrangements should be made to have the administrators of such venues or programs contact the outreach team if they encounter a possible victim of trafficking.

Outreach should be performed using dedicated teams, staffed by full-time employees. The minimum composition of such a team should be two persons. It is highly recommended that such teams include social/cultural moderators who have backgrounds similar to that of potential victims.

Getting a person to tell their story to a team member often requires that trust be built up over several encounters. A potential victim is most likely to talk about their situation one-on-one with a trusted team member in a setting that allows for privacy.

Outreach programs targeting off-the-street prostitution are potentially very promising because of they seek to contact victims who are otherwise inaccessible. However, information about such programs is still largely unavailable.

### ***Applying the Findings to British Columbia: Key Local and Provincial Regulators***

#### *Local Governments*

Under the Community Charter and the Local Government Act, cities, towns, villages, and even regional districts can employ persons for the purpose of the enforcement of bylaws. Such bylaw officers work most prominently in the enforcement of building safety, land use (zoning bylaws) noise, and burning bylaws.

Bylaw inspectors will regularly find themselves conducting inspections of homes or residential properties. These inspections are usually initiated by complaints over illegal construction or occupancy of outbuildings and garages.

License inspectors constitute another group of civil servants employed by local governments who might come into contact with trafficked persons in the performance of their duties. Fire inspectors, for example, conduct inspections of public areas such as restaurants, day care centres, and retail stores. Fire inspectors operate on a rotational schedule. Depending on a class of building, and how the inspection cycle is structured, inspections may be conducted every one, two or three years. (Personal communication with Lorne Fletcher, President, License Inspectors and Bylaw Officers Association of British Columbia, March 05, 2008).

### *Provincial Government*

The Government of British Columbia directly employs some key observer groups. These groups are described below.

The Ministry of Children and Family Development (MCFD) provides youth justice services and youth custody services to young offenders in the province. The Ministry employs 130 youth probation officers (British Columbia, n.d.).

MCFD is also responsible for administering the province's child protection services. It does so through the Child Protection Division and 429 Ministry offices throughout BC (British Columbia, n.d.b).

WorkSafeBC (n.d.) is a provincial agency responsible for promoting workplace health and safety. It employs 200 occupational safety officers who conduct inspections in areas such as occupational hygiene and construction safety. The vast majority of the inspections are initiated as the result of complaints and are not routine (Personal communication with Robert Smith, Occupational Safety Officer, WorkSafeBC, March 09, 2008).

The Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General's, Office of the Fire Commissioner provide services in the area of fire safety and prevention. These services include the administration and enforcement of fire safety legislation and fire inspections. Further research needs to be undertaken to clarify exactly how the Office of the Fire Commissioner relates to local fire inspectors. (British Columbia, n.d.c).

Liquor license inspectors conduct "routine" inspections of licensed premises, such as restaurants, bars, nightclubs and pubs, to ensure the compliance with provincial law and regulations. Liquor license inspectors are employed by the



Liquor Control and Licensing Branch of the Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General (British Columbia, 2008).

The Ministry of Labour and Citizens' Services' Employment Standards Branch Compliance Team conducts unannounced inspections of farms to ensure compliance with employment standards. The Branch as a whole, however, has moved away from the inspection model and does not conduct inspections of other sectors of the economy (Personal communication with Jennifer Hagen, Program Advisor, Employment Standards Branch, Ministry of Labour and Citizens' Services, March 10, 2008).

## **APPENDIX A – SEARCH TERMS AND DATABASES**

### **The Following Search Terms Were Used:**

Human trafficking  
Human trafficking training  
Human trafficking guide\*  
Human trafficking handbook  
Human trafficking manual  
Human trafficking good practices  
Human trafficking best promising practices  
Traffic in persons

### **The Following Engines Were Used:**

Google  
Google Scholar  
Ebsco Host, Academic Search Full Text Elite  
ISI, Web of Knowledge

## **APPENDIX B – CONTACTS**

The following persons have been contacted for the purpose of this review and have expressed willingness to be contacted in the future.

### **CAIM Project**

URL: <http://www.caim.com.pt/main.php?lg=pt>

Rita Penedo

rpenedo@sg.mai.gov.pt

### **Coalition to Abolish Slavery & Trafficking (CAST)**

URL: <http://www.castla.org/>

Imelda Buncab

Outreach & Training Director

Coalition to Abolish Slavery & Trafficking (CAST)

P: 213-365-1906 x111

F: 213-365-5257

### **Bureau of Justice Assistance**

URL: <http://www.ojp.usdoj.gov/BJA/>

Lon McDougal

Policy Adviser [responsible for the Law Enforcement and Service Provider  
Multidisciplinary Anti-Trafficking Task Force program]

Tel: 202-307-3678

Lonnie.R.McDougal@usdoj.gov

### **License Inspectors and Bylaw Officers Association of British Columbia (LIBOA)**

URL: <http://liboa.homestead.com/>

Lorne Fletcher

President

License Inspectors and Bylaw Officers Association of British Columbia

Tel.: 250-474-0604

Fax: 250-391-3435

lfletcher@district.langford.bc.ca



**Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings**

URL: <http://www.osce.org/cthb/>

Anelise Gomes de Araujo

Adviser

Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings

OSCE Secretariat

Wallnerstrasse 6

1010, Vienna - Austria

Tel.: +43-1 514 36 6258

Fax: +43-1 514 36 6299

E-mail: [Anelise.GomesAraujo@osce.org](mailto:Anelise.GomesAraujo@osce.org)

Mobile:(+ 43) 664 1414 830

**Polaris Project**

URL: <http://www.polarisproject.org/>

Bradley Myles

Deputy Director

Polaris Project

PO Box 77892

Washington, DC 20013

Nicole Moler

National Training and Technical Assistance Specialist

Polaris Project

Telephone: 202.745.1001

Fax: 202.745.1119

Email: [nmoler@polarisproject.org](mailto:nmoler@polarisproject.org)

## **APPENDIX C – EXEMPLARY ADDITIONAL SOURCES**

“Animus Association” Foundation/“La Strada” – Bulgaria. (2007). Combating Trafficking in Human Beings: Directory of Practitioners’ Manuals and Handbooks. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.lastradainternational.org/lsidocs/356%20Combating%20THB%20\(Animus%20-%20Directory\).pdf](http://www.lastradainternational.org/lsidocs/356%20Combating%20THB%20(Animus%20-%20Directory).pdf)

Caliber, An ICF International Company. (2006, October). Law Enforcement Response to Human Trafficking and the Implications for Victims: Current Practices and Lessons Learned. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/216547.pdf>

California. California Attorney General. (n.d.). Human Trafficking Training Materials. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://safestate.org/documents/HT\\_Training\\_Curric\\_3\\_2007\\_ADA.pdf](http://safestate.org/documents/HT_Training_Curric_3_2007_ADA.pdf)

Danish Red Cross. 2005. Good Practices in Response to Trafficking in Human Beings: Cooperation Between Civil Society and Law Enforcement in Europe. Claudia Aradau. Retrieved February 21, 2008, from <http://www.redcross.dk/sw59525.asp>

## WORKS CONSULTED

- Anti-Slavery International. 2005. *Protocol for Identification and Assistance to Trafficked Persons and Training Kit*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/resources/PDF/Protocoltraffickedpersonskit2005.pdf>
- British Columbia. Ministry of Children and Family Development. (n.d.a). *Youth Justice*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.mcf.gov.bc.ca/youth\\_justice/community.htm](http://www.mcf.gov.bc.ca/youth_justice/community.htm)
- British Columbia. Ministry of Children and Family Development. (n.d.b). *Protecting Children*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.mcf.gov.bc.ca/child\\_protection/](http://www.mcf.gov.bc.ca/child_protection/)
- British Columbia. Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General. (2008). *Liquor Control and Licensing*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://www.pssq.gov.bc.ca/lclb/>
- British Columbia. Ministry of Public Safety and Solicitor General. (n.d.) *Office of the Fire Commissioner*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://www.pssq.gov.bc.ca/firecom/index.htm>
- Canada. Department of Justice. Research and Statistics Division. (2005). *Victims of Trafficking in Persons: Perspectives from the Canadian Community Sector*. Ottawa. Oxman-Martinez, J., Lacroix, M., & Hanley, J. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://www.canada.justice.gc.ca/en/ps/rs/rep/2006/rr06-3/rr06-3.pdf>
- Coalition to Abolish Slavery and Trafficking. (2005). Retrieved February 20, 2008, from <http://www.castla.org/aboutus/history.htm>
- Danish Red Cross. (2005). *Good Practices in Response to Trafficking in Human Beings: Cooperation Between Civil Society and Law Enforcement in Europe*. C. Aradau. Retrieved February 21, 2008, from <http://www.redcross.dk/sw59525.asp>
- Freedom Network. (n.d.) Human trafficking and slavery: Tools for effective response. *Addressing Modern-Day Slavery in the Land of the Free*. Retrieved February 21, 2008, from <http://www.freedomnetworkusa.org/docs/BrochureV2.pdf>

- International Association of Chiefs of Police. (n.d.) *The Crime of Human Trafficking: A Law Enforcement Guide to Identification and Investigation*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://www.theiacp.org/documents/pdfs/RCD/CompleteHTGuide.pdf>
- International Centre for Migration Policy Development. (2006a). *Anti-Trafficking Training for Judges and Prosecutors in EU Member States and Accession and Candidate Countries: Background Reader*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS\\_JUD/AGIS\\_JUD\\_BG\\_reader.pdf](http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS_JUD/AGIS_JUD_BG_reader.pdf)
- International Centre for Migration Policy Development. (2006b). *Anti-Trafficking Training for Judges and Prosecutors in EU Member States and Accession and Candidate Countries: Handbook*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS\\_JUD/AGIS\\_JUD\\_Handbook.pdf](http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS_JUD/AGIS_JUD_Handbook.pdf)
- International Centre for Migration Policy Development. (2006c). *Anti-Trafficking Training for Judges and Prosecutors in EU Member States and Accession and Candidate Countries: Curriculum-Training Guide*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS\\_JUD/AGIS\\_JUD\\_Curriculum.pdf](http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS_JUD/AGIS_JUD_Curriculum.pdf)
- International Centre for Migration Policy Development. (2006d). *Anti-Trafficking Training for Frontline Law Enforcement Officers: For Police, Border Guards and Customs Officials in EU Member States and Accession and Candidate Countries: Background Reader*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS\\_POL/AGIS\\_POL\\_Background\\_Reader\\_small.pdf](http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS_POL/AGIS_POL_Background_Reader_small.pdf)
- International Centre for Migration Policy Development. (2006e). *Anti-Trafficking Training for Frontline Law Enforcement Officers: For Police, Border Guards and Customs Officials in EU Member States and Accession and Candidate Countries: Training Guide*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS\\_POL/AGIS\\_POL\\_Training\\_Guide\\_small.pdf](http://www.icmpd.org/fileadmin/IIMS-documents/ICMPD/AGIS_POL/AGIS_POL_Training_Guide_small.pdf)
- International Organization for Migration. (2006). *Resource Book for Law Enforcement Officers on Good Practices in Combating Child Trafficking*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://www.iom.int/jahia/Jahia/cache/offonce/pid/1674?entryId=5787>



- Polaris Project. (n.d.). *Training and Technical Assistance*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.polarisproject.org/index.php?option=com\\_content&task=view&id=24&Itemid=44](http://www.polarisproject.org/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=24&Itemid=44)
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (2006). *Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from [http://www.unodc.org/pdf/traffickinginpersons\\_report\\_2006-4.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/pdf/traffickinginpersons_report_2006-4.pdf)
- WorkSafeBC. (2008). Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://www.worksafebc.com/>